

Dr. David Vickers (Royal Northern College of Music / The Handel Institute)

**“Their Sound is gone out into all Lands”: period-instrument recordings of *Messiah*, 1980–2020**

**A chronological discography**

This contains fifty-eight commercially published recordings on which orchestras play on period instruments – all more-or-less complete performances with the exception of three selections of highlights. Recordings since 1980 performed on modern instruments are omitted, including those that are to varying extents ‘historically-informed’ (e.g. Polyphony and Britten Sinfonia, cond. Stephen Layton, Hyperion, 2009). Arrangements (such as those by Mozart, Beecham/Goossens, etc.) are outside the parameters for this research. Dates and locations of recording sessions (where known) and first issue are given, but catalogue numbers and formats (LP, CD, etc.) are omitted because many recordings have been reissued several times in different formats.

**Legend**

Voices

- (s) soprano soloist
- (boy) treble soloist
- (mez) mezzo-soprano soloist (if distinct from female alto soloist on the same recording)
- (a) female alto soloist (no distinction between mezzo-soprano and alto)
- (ct) countertenor soloist
- (t) tenor soloist
- (b) bass soloist (no distinction between bass and baritone)

Instruments

- (ob) oboe
- (fag) bassoon
- (tpt) trumpet
- (hn) horns (doubling trumpets in ‘Hallelujah’ and ‘Worthy is the lamb’)
- (timp) timpani
- (org) organ
- (hpd) harpsichord

Music direction

- (cond) conductor (conducted in a conventional manner)
- (dir) director (conducted from harpsichord)

Other contributions

- (cho) choir master, if different from conductor
- (cm) violinist concertmaster/leader
- (tpt) principal trumpet (solo in ‘The trumpet shall sound’)
- (ln) liner note (if noteworthy, such as author is a Handel scholar)

Judith Nelson (s), Emma Kirkby (s), Carolyn Watkinson (a), Paul Elliott (t), David Thomas (b); The Choir of Christ Church Cathedral Oxford, Simon Preston (cho/org); Academy of Ancient Music, Catherine Mackintosh (cm); Michael Laird (tpt); Christopher Hogwood (cond.); Anthony Hicks (ln); recorded at St Jude on the Hill, Hampstead, London, 1979; L’Oiseau-Lyre (Decca), 1980

1754 Foundling Hospital version

Soloists: s/s/a/t/b = 5

Choir: 16.5.5.5 (all male) = 31

Orchestra: str (15.6.3.2), 4 ob, 4 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 org, 1 hpd = 41

Total = 77<sup>1</sup>

Jennifer Smith (s), Andrew J. King (boy), Charles Brett (ct), Martyn Hill (t), Ulrik Cold (b); Worcester Cathedral Choir, Donald Hunt (cho); La Grande Écurie et la Chambre du Roy; Jean-Claude Malgoire (cond); recorded at Eglise Notre Dame du Liban, Paris, 5–10 July 1980; CBS 1980

Claims to be ‘Original Dublin Version 1742’, but this is not the case

[personnel not listed in CD reissue; choir all male]

<sup>1</sup> Total numbers of performers exclude conductors unless they direct from the harpsichord.

[Selections] Emma Kirkby (s), René Jacobs (ct), Marius van Altena (t), Max von Egmond (b); The University of Michigan Early Music Ensemble Chorus; Ars Musica, Daniel Foster (cm), Fred Holmgren (tpt); Edward Parmentier (dir); recorded at St Andrew's Episcopal Church, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 9 December 1980; University of Michigan School of Music, 1981<sup>2</sup>

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 5.7.6.5 (female altos) = 23

Orchestra: str (6.2.1.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd = 17

Total = 44

Carole Bogard (s), Elvira Green (a), Jeffrey Gall (ct), Charles Bressler (t), Leslie Guinn (b); The American Boys Choir with tenors and basses of the Norman Scribner Chorus; Smithsonian Chamber Players; James Weaver (cond); Howard Serwer (ln); recorded at National Presbyterian Church, Washington D. C., December 1980; The Smithsonian Collection, 1981<sup>3</sup>

[not yet consulted]

no recording issued in 1982

Margaret Marshall (s), Saul Quirke (boy), Catherine Robbin (a), Charles Brett (ct), Anthony Rolfe Johnson (t), Robert Hale (b); Monteverdi Choir; English Baroque Soloists, Elizabeth Wilcock (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt); John Eliot Gardiner (cond); Nicholas Kenyon (ln); recorded in London, November 1982; Philips, 1983

Soloists: s/boy/a/ct/t/b = 6

Choir: 11.7.7.7 (male altos) = 32

Orchestra: str (6.5.4.4.2), 4 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 keyboard (hpd/org) = 31

Total = 69

Elizabeth Gale (s), Marjana Lipovsek (a), Werner Hollweg (t), Roderick Kennedy (b); Stockholmer Kammerchor, Eric Ericson (cho); Concentus Musicus Wien, Alice Harnoncourt (cm), Friedemann Immer (tpt); Nikolaus Harnoncourt (cond); Nikolaus Harnoncourt (ln); recorded live at Berwald Hall, Stockholm, 8–9 November 1982; Teldec Das Alte Werk, 1983

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: [choir members not listed] (female altos) = ?

Orchestra: str (16.4.2.2), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 org, 1 hpd = 33

Total = ?

[Selections] Patrizia Kwella (s), Thomas Drew (boy), Margaret Cable (a), William Kendall (t), Richard Jackson (b); Winchester Cathedral Choir; London Handel Orchestra, Roy Goodman (cm), Stephen Keavy (tpt); Martin Neary (cond); recorded at Winchester Cathedral, 20–22 March 1984; ASV, 1984

[personnel not listed; choir all male]

Marjanne Kweksilber (s), James Bowman (ct), Paul Elliott (t), Gregory Reinhart (b); The Sixteen, Harry Christophers (cho); Amsterdam Baroque Orchestra, Monica Huggett (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt); Ton Koopman (dir); recorded live at the Tempio Malatestiano, Rimini, 31 August 1983, and at the Utrecht Early Music Festival, September 1983; Erato, 1985

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 6.4.4.4 (male altos) = 18

Orchestra: str (6.1.1.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 org, 1 hpd (Koopman) = 17

Total = 39

<sup>2</sup> Issued on LP by the University of Michigan School of Music, this "Selections from The Messiah" included most of Part I. The complete performance was broadcast live on NPR, in association with a symposium held at the University of Michigan. It has never been reissued either on CD or as a digital download.

<sup>3</sup> Only ever issued on LP. According to a review of a concert performance on 17 December 1980 at the National Presbyterian Church, the orchestra had 37 players (Octavio Roca: 'Messiah at the Smithsonian', *The Washington Post*, 18 December 1980).

Edith Mathis (s), James Bowman (ct); Claes H. Ahnsjo (t); Tom Krause (b); University of Maryland Chorus; Paul Traver (cho); Cathedral Choral Society; Richard W. Dirksen (cho); Smithsonian Concerto Grosso; Antal Dorati (cond); Teri Noel Towe (ln); recorded live at the Maryland Handel Festival, Washington Cathedral, 9–10 November 1984; Pro Arte, 1985

Modelled on 1784 Westminster Abbey commemoration<sup>4</sup>

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir = 325

Orchestra = 100 approx

Total = circa 430

no recording issued in 1986

Lynne Dawson (s), Catherine Denley (a), David James (ct), Maldwyn Davies (t), Michael George (b); The Sixteen Choir and Orchestra, Julie Miller (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt); Harry Christophers (cond); Simon Heighes (ln); recorded at St John's Smith Square, London, 16–20 December 1986; Hyperion, 1987

Soloists: s/a/ct/t/b = 5

Choir: 7.4.4.4 (male altos) = 19

Orchestra: str (7.2.2.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 org (no harpsichord) = 20

Total = 44

Arleen Augér (s), Anne Sofie von Otter (a), Michael Chance (ct), Howard Crook (t), John Tomlinson (b); The English Concert Choir; The English Concert, Simon Standage (cm), Michael Laird (tpt); Trevor Pinnock (dir); Donald Burrows (ln); recorded at Abbey Road Studios, London, January 1988; DG Archiv, 1988

Soloists: s/a/ct/t/b = 5

Choir: 10.7.7.8 (mixed altos) = 32

Orchestra: str (6.6.4.5.2), 4 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 org, 1 hpd = 36

Total = 73

Emma Kirkby (s), Emily van Evera (s), Margaret Cable (a), James Bowman (ct), Joseph Cornwell (t), David Thomas (b); Taverner Choir & Players, John Holloway (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt); Andrew Parrott (cond); Clifford Bartlett (ln); recorded at No. 1 Studio Abbey Road, London, April 1988; EMI Reflexe, 1989

1753 version

Soloists: s/s/a/ct/t/b = 6

Choir: 8.5.4.5 (mixed altos) = 22

Orchestra: str (6.6.3.3.2), 4 ob, 4 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 35

Total = 63

no recording issued in 1990

Lorraine Hunt (s), Janet Williams (s), Patricia Spence (a), Drew Minter (ct), Jeffrey Thomas (t), William Parker (b); U.C. Berkeley Chamber Chorus, Philip Brett (cho/org); Philharmonia Baroque Orchestra, Lisa Weiss (cm), Fred Holmgren (tpt); Nicholas McGegan (cond); Nicholas McGegan (ln) and Eleanor Selfridge-Field (ln); recorded at Hertz Hall, University of California, Berkeley, 4–7 January 1991; Harmonia Mundi, 1991

N.B. appendices after each part contain most alternative variants

Soloists: s/s/a/ct/t/b = 6

Choir: 11.11.10.10 (mixed altos) = 42

Orchestra: str (12.4.3.2), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 32

Total = 80

Joan Rodgers (s), Della Jones (a), Christopher Robson (ct), Philip Langridge (t), Bryn Terfel (b); Collegium Musicum 90, Simon Standage (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt); Richard Hickox (cond); Clifford Bartlett (ln); recorded at St Jude on the Hill, Hampstead, London, 11–17 January 1991; Chandos Chaconne, 1991

Soloists: s/a/ct/t/b = 5

Choir: 8.5.5.6 (mixed altos) = 24

Orchestra: str (6.6.3.3.2), 4 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 31

Total = 60

<sup>4</sup> A tricentennial Handel commemoration organised by the Maryland Handel Festival.

Kym Amps (s), Helen Parker (s), Angus Davidson (ct), Frances Jellard (a), Robin Doveton (t), John Bowen (t), David van Asch (b), Adrian Peacock (b); The Scholars Baroque Ensemble, Pauline Nobes (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt), Terence Charlston (org/hpd); David van Asch (cond); recorded at Rosslyn Hill Chapel, Hampstead, London, 6–9 July 1992; Naxos, 1992

Claims to be Dublin 1742 version, but gets several things wrong

Soloists: s/s/a/a/t/t/b/b (8), all from Choir: 4.3.4.3 (mixed altos) = 14

Orchestra: str (7.2.1.1), 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 keyboard (org and hpd) = 15

no oboes or bassoons

Total = 29

Karen Clift (s), Catherine Robbin (a), Bruce Fowler (t), Victor Ledbetter (b); Boston Baroque, Daniel Stepner (cm), Bruce Hall (tpt); Martin Pearlman (dir); Martin Pearlman (ln); recorded at Campion Center, Weston, Massachusetts, 18–22 May 1992; Telarc, 1992

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 6.5.5.5 (female altos) = 21

Orchestra: str (5.4.3.3.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 1 tpt, 1 timp, 1 org, 1 hpd = 23

Total = 48

no recording issued in 1993

Barbara Schlick (s), Sandrine Piau (s), Tommy Williams (boy); Andreas Scholl (ct), Mark Padmore (t), Nathan Berg (b); Les Arts Florissants, Hiro Kurosaki (cm), James Ghigi (tpt); William Christie (cond); Donald Burrows (ln); recorded in December 1993; Harmonia Mundi, 1994

Back cover states 'Oratorio (Dublin, 1742)', but this is not the version performed

Soloists: s/s/boy/ct/t/b = 6

Choir: 10.5.4.6 (mixed altos) = 25

Orchestra: str (7.6.4.4.2), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 keyboard (hpd/org) = 33

Total = 64

Lynne Dawson (s), Hilary Summers (a), John Mark Ainsley (t), Alastair Miles (b), The Choir of King's College, Cambridge; Brandenburg Consort, Roy Goodman (cm), Crispian Steele-Perkins (tpt); Stephen Cleobury (cond); Donald Burrows (ln); recorded at the chapel of King's College chapel, Cambridge, 16–18 December 1992 and 16–18 March 1993; Argo (Decca), 1994<sup>5</sup>

1752 version 1

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 17.4.4.6 (all male) = 31

Orchestra: str (5.5.3.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 26

Total = 61

Julianne Baird (s), Jennifer Lane (a), David Price (t), Kevin Deas (b); Ama Deus Ensemble Chorus and Orchestra; Valentin Radu (cond); recorded at the chapel of Valley Forge Military Academy, Wayne, Pennsylvania, 6–8 July 1994; Vox, 1994

Claims to be 1749 version

[not yet consulted]

no recordings issued 1995

Julianne Baird (s), Christine Brandes (s), Steven Rickards (ct), Quentin Quereau (t), Dean Ely (b), Michael McMurray (b), Apollo's Fire (Cleveland Baroque Orchestra); Jeannette Sorrell (dir); recorded live [Cleveland, Ohio], December 1994 and December 1995; Onda Records, 1996

[not yet consulted]

<sup>5</sup> A live recording by the same soloists, choir and orchestra filmed at the Pieterskerk, Leiden, 1993, has been issued on DVD and reissued on CD numerous times by different labels.

Mona Julsrud (s), Tuva Semmingsen (a), Paul Agnew (t), Njål Sparbo (b); Grex Vocalis; Oslo Baroque Orchestra, Atle Sponberg (cm), Niklas Eklund (tpt); Carl Høgset (cond); recorded live at Ris Church, Oslo, 7–8 December 1996; Quattro, 1997

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 13.10.7.9 (female altos) = 39

Orchestra: str (4.3.2.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 keyboard (hpd) = 19

Total = 62

Midori Suzuki (s), Yoshikazu Mera (ct), John Elwes (t), David Thomas (b); Bach Collegium Japan, Ryo Terakado (cm), Toshio Shimada (tpt); Masaaki Suzuki (cond); recorded at Kobe Shoin Women's University, December 1996; BIS, 1997

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 6.5.4.6 (female altos) = 21

Orchestra: str (6.2.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 19

Total = 44

Dorothea Röschmann (s), Susan Gritton (s), Bernarda Fink (a), Charles Daniels (t), Neal Davies (b); Gabrieli Consort & Players, Anna McDonald (cm), David Hendry (tpt); Paul McCreech (cond); Ruth Smith (ln) and Paul McCreech (ln); recorded at All Saints Church, Tooting, London, December 1996; DG Archiv, 1997

1754 Foundling Hospital version

Soloists: s/s/a/t/b = 5

Choir: 8.6.5.5 (mixed altos) = 24

Orchestra: str (8.6.4.3.2), 4 ob, 4 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 2 hpd, 1 org = 38

Total = 67

[Selections: 'The Complete Choruses'] Nathalie Paulin (s), Matthew White (ct), Benjamin Butterfield (t), Brett Pologato (b); Tafelmusik, Julie Baumgartel (cm); Ivar Taurins (cond); recorded at Grace Church On-the-Hill, Toronto, 14–16 April 1998; CBC Records, 1998<sup>6</sup>

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 11.5.8.6 (mixed altos) = 30

Orchestra: str (5.5.3.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 24

Total = 58

Maja Roodveldt (s), Sytse Buwalda (ct), Paul van den Bemt (t), Julian Hartman (b); Holland Boys Choir and Baroque Orchestra; Pieter Jan Leusink (cond.); recorded at Grote Kerk, Vollenhove, June 1992; Amsterdam Classics, 1999

[personnel not listed; choir all male]

no recordings issued 2000

Lynne Dawson (s), Nicole Heaston (s), Magdalena Kožená (mez), Charlotte Hellekant (a), Brian Asawa (ct), John Mark Ainsley (t), Russell Smythe (b), Brian Bannatyne-Scott (b); Choir of Les Musiciens du Louvre, Sébastien Rouland (cho); Les Musiciens du Louvre, Anton Steck (cm), Jean-Baptiste Lapierre (tpt); Marc Minkowski (cond); Marc Minkowski (ln) and David Hunter (ln); recorded at Salle Debussy, Opéra Bastille, Paris, October 1997; DG Archiv, 2001

Recorded as the soundtrack for William Klein's film *Messiah*

Soloists: s/s/mez/a/ct/t/b/b = 8

Choir: 11.8.8.10 (mixed altos) = 37

Orchestra: str (7.7.4.6.3), 4 ob, 2 fg, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 38

Total = 83

Lynne Dawson (s), Guillemette Laurens (a), Charles Daniels (t), Antonio Abete (b); Coro della Radio Svizzera, Sivo Donato (cho); I Barocchisti, Duilio Galfetti (cm), Andreas Lakner (tpt); Diego Fasolis (cond); recorded at Chiesa di San Nicolao, Lugano, Switzerland, 8–9 June 2000; Arts, 2001

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 8.6.7.7 (female altos) = 28

Orchestra: str (9.2.3.2), 4 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 27

Total = 59

<sup>6</sup> Album contains all choruses, but also includes the symphony, and several solos that run into choruses (such as 'O thou that tellest' and 'Why do the nations').

Sara Macliver (s), Alexandra Sherman (a), Christopher Field (ct), Paul McMahon (t), Teddy Tahu Rhodes (b); Cantillation; Orchestra of the Antipodes, Anna McDonald (cm), Leanne Sullivan (tpt); Antony Walker (cond); Lyle Chan and Richard Lockett (ln); recorded at Cardinal Cerretti Memoria Chapel, St. Patrick's Estate, Manly, Sydney, 10–14 July 2002; ABC Classics, 2002

Soloists: s/a/ct/t/b = 5

Choir: 6.6.6.7 (female altos) = 25

Orchestra: str (5.4.3.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 hpd, 1 org, 1 timp = 23

Total = 53

Siri Karoline Thornhill (s), Martin Wölfel (ct), Jan Kobow (t), Kay Stiefermann (b); Knabenchor Hannover; Barockorchester L'Arco; Jörg Breiding (cond); recorded live at Markuskirche, Hanover, 15–16 Decembe 2002; Ars Musici, 2003

[personnel not listed]

Katherine Fuge (s), Yosemeh Adjei (ct), Hubert Nettinger (t), Yorck Felix Speer (b); Regensburger Domspatzen; Musica Florea Prague; Roland Büchner (cond); recorded live at Auditorium maxumim der Universität Regensburg, 30 May and 1 June 2003; Christian Feldgen Music, 2004<sup>7</sup>

[personnel not listed]

Christine Schäfer (s), Anna Larsson (a), Michael Schade (t), Gerald Finley (b); Arnold Schoenberg Choir, Erwin Ortner (cho); Concentus Musicus Wien; Nikolaus Harnoncourt (cond.); recorded live at the Musikvereinsaal, Vienna, 17–21 December 2004; Deutsche Harmonia Mundi (Sony), 2005

[other than continuo players, personnel not listed]

Arianna Zukerman (s), Daniel Taylor (ct), Steven Tharp (t), William Sharp (b); American Bach Soloists, Elizabeth Blumenstock (cm), John Thiessen (tpt); Jeffrey Thomas (cond); Jeffrey Thomas (ln); recorded at Barbara K. and W. Turrentine Jackson Hall, University of California, Davis, 17–18 December 2004; Delos, 2005

1741 autograph score version

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 8.8.7.8 (female altos) = 31

Orchestra: str (14.4.4.3), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 36

Total = 71

Kerstin Avemo (s), Patricia Bardon (a), Lawrence Zazzo (ct), Kobie van Rensburg (t), Neal Davies (b); Choir of Clare College, Cambridge, Timothy Brown (cho); Freiburger Barockorchester, Petra Müllejans (cm), Friedemann Immer (tpt); René Jacobs (cond); Pierre Degott (ln) and Ruth Smith (ln); recorded at Paulussaal, Freiburg, January 2006; Harmonia Mundi, 2006

1750 version

Soloists: s/a/ct/t/b = 5

Choir: 11.7.7.8 (female altos) = 33

Orchestra: str (6.5.3.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 harp, 1 theorbo, 1 keyboard (hpd/org) = 28

Total = 66

Henry Jenkinson (boy), Otta Jones (boy), Robert Brooks (boy), Iestyn Davies (ct), Toby Spence (t), Eamonn Dougan (b); Choir of New College, Oxford; Academy of Ancient Music, Pauline Nobes (cm), David Blackadder (tpt); Edward Higginbottom (cond); Simon Heighes (ln); recorded at St John's Smith Square, London, 3–8 January 2006; Naxos, 2006

1751 version

Soloists: boy/boy/boy/ct/t/b = 6

Choir: 15.6.5.7 (all male) = 28

Orchestra: str (6.4.2.3.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 24

Total = 58

---

<sup>7</sup> Cuts in Part II.

Susan Hamilton (s), Heather Cairncross (s), Annie Gill (a), Clare Wilkinson (a), Nicholas Mulroy (t), Matthew Brook (b), Edward Caswell (b); Dunedin Consort & Players, Simon Jones (cm), Chris Dicken (tpt); John Butt (dir); John Butt (ln); recorded at Greyfriars Kirk, Edinburgh, 1–4 May 2006; Linn, 2006

1742 Dublin version<sup>8</sup>

Soloists: s/s/a/a/t/b/b (7) all from Choir: 3.4.3.3 (female altos) = 13

Orchestra: str (4.3.2.2.1), 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 17

no oboes or bassoons

Total = 30

Miriam Allan (s), Michael Chance (ct), Mark Le Brocq (t), Christopher Purves (b); Maulbronner Kammerchor; Hannoversche Hofkapelle, Marleen Goede-Uter (cm), Friedemann Immer (tpt); Jurgen Budday (cond); recorded live at Maulbronn Abbey, 24–25 September 2005; K&K Verlagsanstalt, 2007

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 12.14.8.9 (female altos) = 43

Orchestra: str (9.3.2.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 keyboard (hpd/org) = 24

Total = 71

Constanze Backes (s), Ulrike Schneider (a), Mark Calvert (t), Peter Schüler (b); Kammerchor der Heidelberger Studentenkantorei; L'Arpa Festante, Michael Gusenbauer (cm), Jens Jourdan (tpt); Christoph Andreas Schäfer (cond.); recorded live at Heiliggeistkirche, Heidelberg, 16–17 December 2006; Spektral, 2007

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 11.10.5.9 (female altos) = 35

Orchestra: str (7.2.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 keyboard (hpd/org) = 20

Total = 59

Susan Lewis Kavinski (s), Yvette Smith (a), Rufus Müller (t), Nathan Berg (b); Washington National Cathedral Choir; Washington National Cathedral Baroque Orchestra, June Huang (cm), Fred Holmgren (tpt); Michael McCarthy (cond); recorded live at Washington National Cathedral, USA, 6–9 December 2007; Washington National Cathedral Loft Recordings, 2008

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 22(8 boys and 14 girls).5.6.5 (male altos) = 38

Orchestra: str (4.4.3.3.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 23

Total = 65

Carolyn Sampson (s), Catherine Wyn-Rogers (a), Mark Padmore (t), Christopher Purves (b); The Sixteen, Walter Reiter (cm), Robert Farley (tpt); Harry Christophers (cond); recorded at St Paul's Church, Deptford, London, November 2007; Coro, 2008

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 6.4.4.5 (male altos) = 19

Orchestra: str (7.5.3.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 hpd, 1 org = 27

Total = 50

Ailish Tynan (s), Alice Coote (a), Allan Clayton (t), Matthew Rose (b); Choir of King's College, Cambridge; Academy of Ancient Music, Rodolfo Richter (cm), David Blackadder (tpt); Stephen Cleobury (cond); recorded at the chapel of King's College, Cambridge, 4–5 April 2009; EMI, 2009

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 19.5.5.7 (all male) = 36

Orchestra: str (5.5.2.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 keyboardist (hpd/org), 1 continuo org = 23

Total = 63

Carolyn Sampson (s), Daniel Taylor (ct), Benjamin Hulett (t), Peter Harvey (b); Kammerchor Stuttgart; Barockorchester Stuttgart, Martin Jopp (cm), Robert Farley (tpt); Freider Bernius (cond); Magda Marx-Weber (ln); recorded at Evangelische Kirche Gönningen, 26–30 December 2008; Carus, 2009

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 10.7.7.6 (mixed altos) = 30

Orchestra: str (6.5.4.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 keyboardist (hpd/org) = 27

Total = 61

<sup>8</sup> Main performance includes bass setting of 'But who may abide' and recitative version of 'Thou shalt break them'. The recitative version of the former, and the air setting of the latter, are included as an appendix.

Ruby Hughes (s), Anna Dennis (s), Kristina Hammarström (a), Owen Willetts (ct), Daniel Johannsen (t), John McMunn (t), Dominik Wörner (b); Musica Saeculorum, Stephanie-Marie Degand (cm), Fruszina Hara (tpt); Philipp von Steinaecker (cond); recorded at Brixen (Bressanone) Cathedral, Tyrol, 28 August 2009; ORF, 2010<sup>9</sup>

Soloists: s/s/a/ct/t/t/b = 4 (satb) + 3 (s/ct/t from choir) = 7

Choir: 4.3.3.3 (mixed altos) = 13

Orchestra: str (10.3.2.2), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 2 keyboard (both hpd/org) = 28

Total = 45

Amanda Forsythe (s), Elizabeth Shammash (a); Ian Honeyman (t), Ross Hauck (t), Jeffrey Strauss (b); Apollo's Fire, Johanna Novom (cm), Barry Baugness (tpt); Jeannette Sorrell (dir); Jeanette Sorrell (ln); recorded in Cleveland, 12–13 and 16–17 December 2008, and 8 February 2010; Avie, 2011<sup>10</sup>

Soloists: s/a/t/t/b = 4

Choir 8.6.5.4 (mixed altos) = 23

Orchestra: str (4.3.3.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd (Sorrell in arias), 1 org = 21

Total = 48

Karina Gauvin (s), Robin Blaze (ct), Rufus Müller (t), Brett Polegato (b); Tafelmusik, Christopher Verrette (cm), John Thiessen (tpt); Ivars Taurins (cond); recorded live at Koerner Hall, The Royal Conservatory, Toronto, 14–17 December 2011; Tafelmusik, 2012

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 8.5.6.5 (mixed altos) = 24

Orchestra: str (5.5.3.3.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 25

Total = 53

Tanya Aspelmeier (s), Aurore Bucher (s), Stéphanie Révidat (s), Julien Freymuth (ct), Alessandro Giangrande (ct), Kathrin Hildebrandt (a), Henning Kaiser (t), Sebastien Obrecht (t), François Rougier (t), Ekkehard Abele (b), Manfred Bittner (b), Matthieu Lécroart (b); La Chapelle Rhénane, Guillaume Humbrecht (cm), Florian Léard (tpt); Benoît Haller (cond); recorded live at Théâtre Les Gémeaux, Sceaux, 13–14 October 2012; K617, 2013

Soloists are also the choir: s/s/s/ct/ct/a/t/t/t/b/b/b = 12

Orchestra: str (3.3.2.1.1), 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 15

no oboes or bassoons

Total = 27

Olga Zinovieva (s), Jana Mamonova (s), Sytse Buwalda (ct), Martinus Leusink (t), Andrew Slater (b); The Bach Choir and Orchestra of the Netherlands, Igor Ruhadze (cm), Frank Anepool (tpt); Pieter Jan Leusink (cond.); recorded at Grote Kerk, Elburg, June 2013; Amsterdam Classics, 2013

Soloists: s/s/ct/t/b = 5 (b also in choir)

Choir: 6.4.4.4 (male altos) = 18

Orchestra: str (4.4.2.1.1), 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 17

Total = 39

Gillian Keith (s), Daniel Taylor (ct), Tom Randle (t), Sumner Thompson (b); Handel and Haydn Society, Aisslinn Nosky (cm), Jesse Levine (tpt); Harry Christophers (cond); Ellen T. Harris (ln); recorded live at Symphony Hall, Boston MA, 29 November – 1 December 2013; Coro, 2014

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 10.8.6.6 (mixed altos) = 30

Orchestra: str (6.6.4.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 29

Total = 63

Lucy Crowe (s), Tim Mead (ct), Andrew Staples (t), Christopher Purves (b); Le Concert d'Astrée, David Bates (cho), David Plantier (cm), Guy Ferber (tpt); Emmanuelle Haïm (cond); Simon Heighes (ln); recorded at Opéra de Lille, 4–7 December 2013; Erato, 2014

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 6.5.4.5 (male altos) = 20

Orchestra: str (5.5.3.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 26

Total = 50

<sup>9</sup> 'Lift up your heads' is cut, but otherwise complete.

<sup>10</sup> Some cuts in Part II, and the da capo of 'He was despised' is shortened.



Julia Doyle (s), Lawrence Zazzo (ct), Steve Davislim (t), Neal Davies (b); Chor des Bayerischen Rundfunks; B'Rock, Daniela Helm (cm), Fruzsina Hara (tpt); Peter Dijkstra (cond); recorded live at Herkulesaal, Munich, 21–27 November 2014; BR Klassik, 2015

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir (female altos): 9.8.8.8 = 33

Orchestra: str (6.6.4.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 2 hn, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 hpd, 1 org = 32

Total = 69

Miriam Feuersinger (s), Flavio Ferri-Benedetti (ct), Dino Lüthy (t), Raitis Grigalis (b); Musica Fiorita, German Echeverri (cm), Jean-François Madeuf (tpt); Daniela Dolci (dir); recorded at Pfarrei Heilig Kreuz, Binningen, Switzerland, 19–23 October 2015; Pan Classics, 2016

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4 (ct, t and b also in choir)

Choir: 3.3.3.3 (male altos) = 15

Orchestra: str (4.2.1.1), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, [2<sup>nd</sup> fag plays timp], 2 theorbos (one of them probably an archlute), 2 keyboards (both hpd/org) = 18

Total = 34

Hanna Herfurtner (s), Gaia Petrone (a), Michael Schade (t), Christian Immler (b); Salzburger Bachchor; Andreas Glaßner (cho); Bach Consort Wien, Agnes Stradner (cm), Martin Patscheider (tpt); Rubén Dubrovsky (cond); recorded live at Basilica Stift Klosterneuburg, Austria, 19 March 2016; Gramola, 2016 [heavy cuts in Parts II and III]

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 7.6.5.6 (female altos) = 24

Orchestra: str (8.2.2.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 org (no hpd) = 21

Total = 49

Sandrine Piau (s), Katherine Watson (s), Anthea Pichanick (a), Rupert Charlesworth (t), Andreas Wolf (b); Le Concert Spirituel, Alice Piérot (cm), Jean-François Madeuf (tpt); Hervé Niquet (cond); Peter Wollny (ln); recorded at Notre-Dame du Liban, Paris, 20–22 December 2016; Alpha, 2017

1754 Foundling Hospital version, but altered<sup>11</sup>

Soloists: s/s/a/t/b = 5

Choir: 9.6.6.6 (mixed altos) = 27

Orchestra: str (5.5.3.3.2), 3 ob, 3 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 29

Total = 61

Kerstin Avemo (s), Anna Zander (a), Michael Weinius (t), Karl-Magnus Fredriksson (b); S:t Jacobs Kammarkör; Rebaroque, Maria Lindal (cm), Johan Åkervall (tpt); Gary Graden (cond); recorded live at Stockholm Cathedral, 25–27 November 2016; Proprius, 2017

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir: 9.9.8.9 (female altos) = 26

Orchestra: str (3.3.2.2.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 2 org (no hpd) = 21

Total = 51

Nao Hirose (s), Mutsumi Hatano (a), Hirohisa Tsuji (t), Masato Makino (b), Cannons Concert Chamber Choir & Orchestra, Satami Watanabe (cm), Tomohiro Hirano (tpt); Toshiki Misawa (cond); Toshiki Misawa (ln); recorded at Higashiyamato Humming Hall, Tokyo, 30 March–1 April 2018; ALM Records, 2018

1741 autograph score version

Soloists: s/a/t/b = 4

Choir (mixed altos): 7.6.4.5 = 22

Orchestra: str (4.4.2.2.1), 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 hpd, 1 org = 18

No oboes or bassoons

Total = 44

<sup>11</sup> Niquet performs the long Pifa and shortens 'The trumpet shall sound' to its A section only.

Giulia Semenzato (s), Benno Schachtner (ct), Krystian Adam (t), Krešimir Stražanac (b); Collegium Vocale 1704; Collegium 1704, Helena Zemanová (cm), Hans-Martin Rux (tpt); Václav Luks (cond); David Vickers (ln); recorded live at Rudolfinum, Prague, March 2018; Accent, 2019

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 5.5.5.5 (female altos) = 20

Orchestra: str (5.5.4.3.2), 2 ob, 2 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 hpd, 1 org = 29

Total = 53

Rachel Redmond (s), Damien Guillon (ct), Nicholas Mulroy (t), Matthias Winckler (b); Capella Reial de Catalunya; Lluís Vilamajó (cho); Le Concert des Nations, Manfredo Kraemer (cm), Guy Ferber (tpt); Jordi Savall (cond); recorded live at Chappelle Royale du Château de Versailles, 18–19 December 2017; Alia Vox, 2019

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 7.5.5.5 (mixed altos) = 22

Orchestra: str (5.5.3.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 org, 1 hpd = 27

Total = 53

Dorothee Miels (s), Benno Schachtner (ct), Benedikt Kristjánsson (t), Tobias Berndt (b); Gaechinger Cantorey, Mayumi Hirasaki (cm), Hannes Rux-Brachtendorf (tpt); Hans-Christoph Rademann (cond); recorded at Margarethenkirche, Gotha, September 2019; Accentus, 2020

1742 Dublin version, but with some questionable decisions

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 5.5.5.7 (mixed altos) = 22

Orchestra: str (7.3.2.1), 2 ob, 1 fag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 keyboard (hpd/org) = 20

Total = 46

Julia Doyle (s), Tim Mead (ct), Thomas Hobbs (t), Roderick Williams (b); RIAS Kammerchor; Akademie für Alte Musik Berlin, Bernhard Forck (cm), Ute Hartwich (tpt); Justin Doyle (cond); recorded at Jesus-Christus-Kirche, Berlin-Dahlem, January 2020; Pentatone, 2020

Soloists: s/ct/t/b = 4

Choir: 10.8.8.8 (female altos) = 34

Orchestra: str (6.5.4.3.2), 2 ob, 1 fag, 1 contrafag, 2 tpt, 1 timp, 1 theorbo, 1 hpd, 1 org = 30

Total = 68

no recording issued so far in 2021

## Acknowledgments

For help with access to commercial recordings a little bit off the beaten track or now only available digitally, original liner notes, or information on orchestral and choral personnel uncredited in booklets, I am grateful to Flavio Ferri-Benedetti, Andreas Bertram (Spektral Records), Sandra Bowdler and Alison Johnston (for help regarding ABC Classics), Sharon Buffel (B'Rock), John Butt, Roy Goodman, Carl Høgset (Grex Vocalis), Josef-Stefan Kindler and Andreas Otto Grimminger (K&K Verlaganstalt), Michael Lynn (for help regarding Ars Musica and Edward Parmentier), Patricia McGuire (archivist, King's College, Cambridge), Christina McMaster (Warner Classics), John McMunn (Academy of Ancient Music), Toshiki Misawa (Handel Festival Japan), Christina Ostrower (Regensburger Domspatzen), Victoria Parker (Loft Recordings), Valentin Radu (Ama Deus Ensemble), Allison Richards and Margi Haigh (Apollo's Fire), Rosa Mara Schmid (Bayerische Rundfunks Chor), Susanne Streefkerk-Stoker (The Bach Choir & Orchestra of the Netherlands), Ivars Taurins (Tafelmusik), and Geoff Thomason and Douglas Badger (RNCM library).